Level 1 Trauma Center Studies Characterizing Dog Bite Injuries Across Major U.S. Geographical Regions (2011-2020)

Summary

Table 1. From 2011 to 2020, 14 peer-reviewed retrospective medical studies from Level 1 trauma centers spanning all major geographical regions in the United States-Northeast, Southeast, South, Southwest, Midwest, West Coast and Northwest-all report similar findings. Pit bulls are inflicting a higher prevalence of injuries than all other breeds of dogs. The majority of these studies (12 of 14) also report that pit bulls are inflicting the most severe injuries, requiring a higher number of operative interventions-up to five times higher-than other dog breeds.

Table 2. Four studies from this period—all from Level 1 trauma centers in the Denver metro area—show a mixture of results, possibly due to Denver and the surrounding metropolitan regions enforcing pit bull bans for the last 3 decades.

Criteria for inclusion in this trauma study table requires being a multi-year retrospective study of U.S. Level 1 trauma center dog bite patients (\geq 15 patients), published from 2011 to 2020, the inclusion of dog breed information, and the scientific research conducted by medical doctors.

Years	Region	Breed & Injury Prevalence	Severity Information	Ref
Published: Mar. 2020 Study period: 2009-2018 [†] <i>K. Khan</i>	Southeast - Regional Level 1 trauma center - Charleston, West Virginia	182 patients studied craniofacial and related injuries. Patient gender, 53% girls ≤ 10 and 65% female ≥ 11. Pit bulls inflicted the highest prevalence of attacks, 27% (49), followed by German shepherds, 6% (11), among the top-biting breeds. Breed was known in 90% (163/182) of all cases.	Pit bulls inflicted the most complex wounds, 63% (41/65), the most mauling injuries, 71% (12/17), when 3 or more bites occurred over 2 or more distinct regional anatomic areas, and the most fractures, 47% (7/15), within the top- biting breeds.	1
more complex	wounds, were ofte a bite resulting in a	at compared with other dog breed n unprovoked, and went off prop complex wound was 4.4 times h	erty to attack The igher for pit bulls	

Table 1: Major U.S. Geographical Regions

compared with the other top-biting breeds ... and the odds of an off-property attack by a pit bull was 2.7 times greater than that for all other breeds."

Published: Jul. 2019 Study period: $2011-2016^{\dagger}$ J. Abraham	South - [Blinded] emergency department ([Blinded]), Texas [‡]	102 pediatric patients studied, 57% were girls. 80 dogs were identified by breed in 75 encounters (74% of total 102 encounters). Pit bulls inflicted the highest prevalence of injuries, 36.2%, when breed was known, followed by Labradors, 10%.	92.1% of injuries involved the head-neck region and 72.5% were of major severity. The pit bull was the most commonly identified breed involving major injury, including the only patients that required ICU monitoring.	2
--	---	---	---	---

Findings: "Parental presence was reported in 43.6% of cases, and most attacks occurred in the evening (46.8%). Injuries often involved the head–neck region (92.1%), and 72.5% were of major severity."

"The most commonly identified breed was the pit bull, followed by the Labrador retriever. Pit bulls were also the most commonly identified breed involved in major injuries."

Published:	West Coast -	189 patients studied, all	Pit bulls were responsible	3
May 2019	Level 1 trauma	adults \geq 18. Breed identified	for 36.8% of head and	
Study	center - Irvine,	in 61 cases, 32.2%. Pit bulls	neck injuries when breed	
period:	California	inflicted the highest	was known (7/19). 65.5%	
2010-2014		prevalence of injuries, 47.5%	of pit bull attacks	
2010-2014		(29), when breed was known	involved the extremities.	
C. Lee		and 15.3% of total studied.	Other dog breeds were	
			more evenly distributed.	

Results: "The most common breed of dog identified was pit bull (n = 29, 47.5%). The majority of pit bull attacks involved the extremities (65.5%) compared to other breeds of dogs. Pit bull victims were noted to have a lower average annual income compared to other breed victims ... However, this was not statistically significant (0.16)."

Published: Feb. 2019 Study period: 2002-2017 <i>G. Essig Jr.</i>	Midwest - Two Pediatric Level 1 trauma centers - Columbus, Ohio and Charlottesville, Virginia	Meta-study analysis conducted across 43 studies (1970 to current) to determine breed prevalence in all bites. Pit bulls were responsible for the highest percentage of reported bites across all the studies (22.5%) followed by mixed-breed (21.2%) and German shepherds (17.8%).	240 pediatric patients studied head, neck injuries only. Each patient characterized into an ordinal scale of bite injury. Mixed-breeds and pit bulls had the highest relative risk of biting, and also had the highest average tissue damage per bite.	4
--	--	--	--	---

Findings: "Injuries from pit bulls and mixed-breed dogs were both more frequent and more severe ... Physical characteristics like brachycephalic head shape and weight between 66 and 100 pounds were found to have both the highest bite risk and highest average tissue damage per bite."

"We recommend separating children from high-risk breeds and high-risk phenotypes reported in this study. Selecting for animals with low risk for biting and tissue damage may lower the risk injury."

Published:	West Coast -	95 patients studied	Pit bulls were responsible	ļ
Sep. 2018	Level 1 trauma	orthopaedic injuries	for 78% of all amputation	
Study	center - Fresno,	requiring specialized	injuries. Of those bitten	
period:	California	treatment only. Pit bulls	by pit bulls, 51% had a	
2010-2016		inflicted the highest	bony injury. Bites from	
2010-2010		prevalence of injuries, 50%	law enforcement dogs	
J. Brice		(47), followed by law	resulted in 24% bony	
		enforcement dogs, 22% (21),	injuries. 66% of pit bull	
		of total studied. Breed was	bite patients (31/47)	
		known in 84% (80) of all	sustained an amputation	
		cases.	or bony injury.	

Conclusions: "Thirty-nine percent of all dog bite-related emergency department visits at our facility resulted in an injury requiring orthopaedic treatment. Pit bull terrier bites were responsible for a significantly higher number of orthopaedic injuries and resulted in an amputation and/or bony injury in 66% of patients treated, whereas bites from law enforcement dogs and other breeds were less associated with severe injuries."

South - Two	740 patients studied, 574	Of the 31 adult trauma
Level 1 trauma	children and 166 adults. Pit	cases in which a breed
centers,	bulls inflicted the highest	was recorded, 42%
pediatric and	prevalence of injuries to	(13/31), pit bulls were
adult - Little	children, 28.1% (55), when	represented in 69% of
Rock, Arkansas	breed was known. Breed was	cases. Of all child and
	recorded in 34% (195/574) of	adult cases combined
	pediatric cases and 58.6%	that required operative
	(17/29) of pediatric cases that	intervention, pit bulls
	required operative	were represented in
	intervention.	62.5% of cases.
	Level 1 trauma centers, pediatric and adult - Little	Level 1 trauma centers, pediatric and adult - Little Rock, Arkansas Level 1 trauma centers, pediatric and adult - Little Rock, Arkansas Children, 28.1% (55), when breed was known. Breed was recorded in 34% (195/574) of pediatric cases and 58.6% (17/29) of pediatric cases that required operative

Findings: "Our study corroborates much of the previous literature, supporting the notion that pit bull bites are severe enough to require operative intervention more frequently than the bites of other dog breeds ... Indeed, when looking at cases that required operative interventions, pit bulls were disproportionately represented in 62.5% of cases."

Published:	Northeast -	108 pediatric patients	4/10/0 of pit ball infaires	7
Oct. 2017	Pediatric Level 1	studied. 17 dog breeds	required operative repair,	
Study	trauma center -	identified in 56 cases, 52%.	which was 3 times more	
period:	Westchester,	Pit bulls inflicted the highest	than other breeds. Of the	
2012-2014	New York	prevalence of injuries, 48.2%	9 patients with extended	
2012-2014		(27), when breed was known	hospitalization, 66.7%	
K. Alizadeh		and 25% of total studied.	were caused by a pit bull.	

Findings: "Of the 56 cases that had an identified dog breed, pit bulls accounted for 48.2% of the dog bites … More importantly, 47.8% of pit bull injuries required operative repair, which was 3 times more than other breeds."

"Of the 9 patients with extended hospitalization, 6 (66.7%) were caused by a pit bull that confirms our theory that this breed results in the most devastating injuries at our center. The penetrating and crushing nature of these bites can lead to lifelong deformities."

Findings: "Pit bull bites were implicated in half of all surgeries performed and over 2.5 times as likely to bite in multiple anatomic locations as compared to other breeds."

"Our data were consistent with others, in that an operative intervention was more than 3 times as likely to be associated with a pit bull injury than with any other breed."

Published:	Northwest -	342 patients studied. Breed	5 patients (1.5%) ages < 7	9
Jul/Aug	Regional Level 1	identified in 270 cases, 79%.	sustained facial fractures.	
2016	trauma center -	Pit bulls inflicted the highest	3 sustained orbital	
Study	Seattle,	prevalence of injuries 27%	fractures inflicted by a	
period:	Washington	(92) of total studied and 25%	doberman, husky and	
*		(22.7) of all ocular injuries.	Labrador, 1 sustained a	
2003-2013		Among dogs unknown to	nasal bone fracture by a	
M. Prendes		patients, pit bulls inflicted	pit bull, and 1 sustained a	
		60% of all injuries and 63%	depressed skull fracture	
		of ocular injuries.	by a German shepherd.	

Findings: "Importantly, this study is the first to accurately establish that pit bulls are the breed most commonly associated with ocular injuries (25%). Most alarming is the observation that when attacks come from unfamiliar dogs, the pit bull was responsible for 60% and 63% of all injuries and ocular injuries, respectively."

Published:	Southeast -	20 patients studied head,	Pit bulls were more	10
May 2015	Level 1 trauma	neck and facial injuries only	frequently associated	
Study	center -	treated by oral and	with injuries than other	
period:	Knoxville,	maxillofacial surgery. Breed	dog breeds (9/20). Two	
2006-2013 [†]	Tennessee	identified in 16 cases, 80%.	cases involved multiple	
2000-2013		Pit bulls inflicted the highest	dogs, all of which were	
M. Foster		prevalence of injuries, 56%	pit bulls. A pit bull	
		(9), when breed was known	inflicted the only fatality.	
		and 45% of total studied.		

Results: "The medical records from 20 patients were included and reviewed. More than one half (60%) of the patients were younger than 12 years old. The dog was owned by the patient or a relative in 58% of the cases. The children sustained injuries requiring hospital admission and repair in an operating room setting more often than did the adults. Pit bulls were more frequently associated with injuries than other breeds (9 of 20)."

Published: Feb. 2015 Study	Southwest - Pediatric Level 1 trauma center - Phoenix,	282 pediatric patients studied. Breed identified in 213 cases, 75.5%. Pit bulls inflicted the highest	Among the 11 patients with the highest AIS (3– 5), pit bulls were responsible in 45.5% of	11
period: 2007-2013 <i>E. Garvey</i>	Arizona	prevalence of injuries, 39% (83), when breed was known and 29.4% of total studied.	cases. Pit bulls also accounted for 38% of all head, neck or facial bites.	

Findings: "Pit bulls were most frequently responsible, accounting for 39% (83/213) of incidents in which dog breed was documented ... Among the 11 patients with the highest AIS (3–5), Pit bulls were responsible in 45.5% of cases, followed by mixed-breeds in 18.2% (2/11) of cases. Pit bulls were also responsible for 38% of all head, neck or face bites."

"Dog familiarity did not confer safety, and in this series, pit bulls were most frequently responsible. These findings have great relevance for child safety."

Published: Jan/Feb 2015 Study period: 2012-2013 D. O'Brien
--

Results: "Of the more than 8 different breeds identified, one-third were caused by pit bull terriers and resulted in the highest rate of consultation (94%) and had 5 times the relative rate of surgical intervention. Unlike all other breeds, pit bull terriers were relatively more likely to attack an unknown individual (+31%), and without provocation (+48%)."

	Published:	Southeast -	40 pediatric patients studied	The skull and orbital	13
	Nov/Dec	Regional Level 1	facial, head and neck	fractures were caused by	
	2011	trauma center -	injuries only. Breed identified	a pit bull bite, which is	
	Study period:	Charleston,	in 30 cases, 75%. Pit bulls	characterized as a "vice-	
		West Virginia	inflicted the highest	grip" which crushes,	
	2005-2009		prevalence of injuries, 40%	avulses and strangles,	
			(12), when breed was known	potentially making it a	
	B. Horswell		and 30% of total studied.	more dangerous breed.	
					1

Findings: "Bites from large-breed dogs, especially pit bull-type dogs and rottweilers are more likely to result in more severe injuries, subsequent medical care and report, which may over-represent those breeds among biting dogs -- in other words, creating reporting bias. However the severity of injury necessitating medical attention should not be overlooked when considering the breed of dog generating more severe injuries."

Published: Apr. 2011	South - Level 1 trauma center -	228 patients studied. Breed identified in 82 cases, 36%.	Attacks by pit bulls were associated with a higher	14
-	San Antonio,	Pit bulls inflicted the highest	median Injury Severity	
Study period:	Texas	prevalence of injuries, 35%	Scale score, a higher risk	
*		(29), when breed was known.	of an admission Glasgow	
1994-2009		There were three dog bite	Coma Scale score of 8 or	
J. Bini		fatalities; pit bulls inflicted all	lower, higher median	
		three deaths.	hospital charges, and a	
			higher risk of death.	

Conclusions: "Attacks by pit bulls are associated with higher morbidity rates, higher hospital charges, and a higher risk of death than are attacks by other breeds of dogs. Strict regulation of pit bulls may substantially reduce the US mortality rates related to dog bites."

Level 1 Trauma Center Studies Characterizing Dog Bite Injuries In Denver, Colorado Region (2013-2017)

Summary

In October 1989, the city and county of Denver adopted a pit bull ban. Notably, in 1994, one of the first epidemiological studies of "breeds of biting dogs" was carried out in the county of Denver, despite the absence of pit bull terriers due to the ban (Which Breeds Bite? A Case-Control Study of Risk Factors).[§] As a result, pit bulls did not appear in the case-control study's "biting" or "nonbiting" breed findings (Gershman, 1994).

From 2013 to 2017, one of four Level 1 trauma center studies in the Denver metro area showed that pit bulls continue to have a high prevalence of facial injuries (Gurunluoglu, 2014). Another study, also limited to facial injuries, states that while the prevalence of pit bull injuries was low during their study period (2003-2008), the severity of pit bull injury included, "the patient who suffered the most extensive injuries and the longest hospitalization of our entire population" (Chen, 2013).

On November 3, 2020, Denver voters repealed the city's longstanding pit bull ban and replaced it with a provisional "breed-restricted license" ordinance. The new law requires pit bull owners to register and microchip their dogs and limits the ownership of pit bulls to two per household.

Table 2: Denver Level 1 Trauma Centers

Children's Hospital Colorado and Denver Health Level 1 Trauma Center are regional Level 1 trauma centers that serve the Denver metro area and 7-state Rocky Mountain region.

Years	Region	Breed & Injury Prevalence	Severity Information	Ref
Published: Jan. 2017 Study period: 2000-2015 [†] <i>R. Kumar</i>	West - Regional Pediatric Level 1 trauma center - Denver, Colorado	17 pediatric patients studied neurosurgical consultation for head and neck injuries only. Patient gender, 53% girls. Akitas and German shepherds inflicted the highest prevalence of wounds (3 each) followed by American bulldogs, Labradors, large mixed- breed dogs and pit bulls (2 each).	All attacks requiring neurosurgical consultation were committed by large- breed dogs. Neurological deficits, all of which were considered catastrophic, developed in 3 patients involving an akita (1), American bulldog (1) and unknown breed (1).	15
Conclusions: "In this study, large-breed dogs were responsible for all attacks on ch requiring neurosurgical consultation. Most dogs were family pets with no history of aggression, and most of the attacks occurred at home."				
"Parental supervision, though important, may not be enough, given that the majority attacks in this series occurred in the presence of an adult, even those with catastrophin neurological injury."				
Published: May 2014 Study period: 2006-2012 <i>R</i> . <i>Gurunluoglu</i>	West - Regional Level 1 trauma center - Denver, Colorado	75 patients studied, 98 total wounds facial dog bite injuries treated by plastic surgery only. Pit bulls and German shepherds inflicted the highest prevalence of wounds, 11.6% each (11/95), when breed was known and 11.22% each of total wounds.	Over half of all wounds inflicted by pit bulls and German shepherds required reconstruction procedures (7/11 each). Combined, the two breeds accounted for 37% (14/38) of all reconstruction procedures performed.	16
Findings: "Ninety-eight wounds in the head and neck region were repaired. Twelve different breeds were identified. There was no significant association between the type of dog breed and the number of bite injuries There was no statistically significant association between wounds needing reconstruction versus direct repair according to dog breed."				
Published: Dec. 2013 Study	West - Regional Pediatric Level 1 trauma center -	537 pediatric patients studied facial dog bite injuries only. Breed identified in 366 cases,	There were 11 victims of pit bull bites from 2003 to 2008, including the patient who suffered the	17

period: Aurora, 2003-2008 Colorado <i>H. Chen</i>	68.2%. Mixed-breed inflicted the highest prevalence of injuries, 23% (84), when breed was known and 16% of total studied.	most extensive injuries and the longest hospitalization of our entire population.
---	--	--

Findings: "Pit bulls were banned in Denver because of several gruesome maulings and fatalities that occurred between 1984 and 1989. Our study found 11 victims of pit bull bites from 2003 to 2008, including the patient who suffered the most extensive injuries and the longest hospitalization of our entire population, indicating that despite legislation, pit bull bites continue to be a public health concern."

Published:	West -	17 pediatric patients studied	15 of the 17 patients	18
May/Jun	Regional	facial fracture dog bite	required hospitalization.	
2013	Pediatric Level 1	injuries only. Patient	One patient suffered	
Study	trauma center -	gender, 53% girls. Breed	"degloving injury to the	
period:	Aurora,	identified in all 17 cases.	face" and the amputation	
2003-2011 [†]	Colorado	German shepherds inflicted	of his left arm after being	
2003-2011		the highest prevalence of	severely mauled by his	
W. Leslie		injuries, 23.5% (4 of 17)	family's pit bull.	
		followed by pit bulls 17.6%.		
				1

Findings: "Seventeen of 1,201 (1.4%) children with dog bite injuries to the face also sustained facial fractures. The average age of patients was 3.9+/-3.2 years and 53% were female. Thirty-five percent of patients presented with multiple facial fractures ... Almost a quarter (4 of 17, 23.5%) of the attacking dogs that caused facial fractures were German Shepherds," followed by pit bulls with 17.6% (3 of 17).

Citations

1.) Khan K, Horswell B and Samanta D, <u>Dog-Bite Injuries to the Craniofacial Region: An Epidemiologic</u> <u>and Pattern-of-Injury Review at a Level 1 Trauma Center</u>, *J Oral Maxillofac Surg*, March 2020 [2019 Nov 14, Epub].

2.) Abraham JT, Czerwinski M, <u>Pediatric Dog Bite Injuries in Central Texas</u>, *Journal of Pediatric Surgery*, July 2019 [2018 Oct 31, Epub].

3.) Lee, Christine J, Santos, Pauline Joy F, Vyas, Raj M, <u>Epidemiology, Socioeconomic Analysis, and</u> <u>Specialist Involvement in Dog Bite Wounds in Adults</u>, *J Craniofac Surg*, May 2019;30(3):753-757.

4.) Essig G, Sheehan C, Rikhi S, Elmaraghy C and Christophel J, <u>Dog Bite Injuries to the Face: Is There</u> <u>Risk with Breed Ownership? A Systematic Review with Meta-Analysis</u>, *International Journal of Pediatric Otorhinolaryngology*, Volume 117, February 2019.

5.) Brice J, Lindvall E, Hoekzema N, Husak L, <u>Dogs and Orthopaedic Injuries: Is There a Correlation to</u> <u>Breed?</u>, *J Orthop Trauma*, 2018 Sep;32(9):e372-e375.

6.) Smith AM, Carlson J, Bartels AB, McLeod CB and Golinko MS, <u>Characteristics of Dog Bites in</u> <u>Arkansas</u>, *South Med J*, 2018 Aug;111(8):494-500.

7.) Alizadeh, K, Shayesteh, A, Xu, ML, <u>An Algorithmic Approach to Operative Management of Complex</u> <u>Pediatric Dog Bites: 3-Year Review of a Level I Regional Referral Pediatric Trauma Hospital</u>, *Plast Reconstr Surg Glob Open*, October 2017. 8.) Golinko MS, Arslanian B, Williams JK, <u>Characteristics of 1616 Consecutive Dog Bite Injuries at a</u> <u>Single Institution</u>, *Clinical Pediatrics (Phila)*, April 2017;56:316–325 [July 2016, Epub].

9.) Prendes MA, Jian-Amadi A, Chang SH and Shaftel SS, <u>Ocular Trauma From Dog Bites:</u> <u>Characterization, Associations, and Treatment Patterns at a Regional Level I Trauma Center Over 11</u> <u>Years, Ophthalmic Plast Reconstr Surg</u>, 2016 Jul-Aug;32(4):279-83 [June 2015, Epub].

10.) Foster MD and Hudson JW, <u>Contemporary Update on the Treatment of Dog Bite: Injuries to the</u> <u>Oral and Maxillofacial Region</u>, *J Oral Maxillofac Surg*, May 2015 Volume 73, Issue 5, Pages 935–942.

11.) Garvey EM, Twitchell DK, Ragar R, Egan JC and Jamshidi R, <u>Morbidity of pediatric dog bites: A case series at a level one pediatric trauma center</u>, *J Pediatr Surg*, February 2015;50:343-6.

12.) O'Brien DC, Andre TB, Robinson AD, Squires LD and Tollefson TT, <u>Dog bites of the head and neck:</u> an evaluation of a common pediatric trauma and associated treatment, *Am J Otolaryngol*, 2015 Jan-Feb; 36(1): 32–38. [2014 Sep 28, Epub].

13.) Horswell BB and Chahine CJ, <u>Dog Bites of the Face, Head and Neck in Children</u>, *WV Med J*, Nov-Dec 2011.

14.) Bini JK, Cohn SM, Acosta SM, McFarland MJ, Muir MT, Michalek JE; TRISAT Clinical Trials Group, <u>Mortality, Mauling, and Maiming by Vicious Dogs</u>, *Ann Surg*, April 2011;253:791-797.

15.) Kumar R, Deleyiannis FW, Wilkinson C and, O'Neill BR, <u>Neurosurgical sequelae of domestic dog</u> <u>attacks in children</u>, *J Neurosurg Pediatr*, January 2017:24-31 [Epub 2016 Oct 21].

16.) Gurunluoglu R, Glasgow M, Arton J and Bronsert M, <u>Retrospective analysis of facial dog bite</u> injuries at a Level I trauma center in the Denver metro area, *J Trauma Acute Care Surg*, 2014 May;76(5):1294-300.

17.) Chen HH, Neumeier AT, Davies BW and Durairaj VD, <u>Analysis of Pediatric Facial Dog Bites</u>, *Craniomaxillofac Trauma Reconstr*, Dec; 6(4): 225–232 [Sept 2013, Epub].

18.) Wei LA, Chen HH, Hink EM, Durairaj VD. <u>Pediatric facial fractures from dog bites</u>. *Ophthal Plast Reconstr Surg*. 2013 May-Jun;29(3):179-182.

[†] Indicates gender reversal in patients, a female predilection instead of male.

⁺ 72.5% of dog bite injuries in this study were of "major severity." Thus, it is presumed the blinded institution was a pediatric Level 1 trauma center and is therefore included in our literature review.

[§] Gershman KA, Sacks JJ, and Wright JC, <u>Which Dogs Bite? A Case Control Study of Risk Factors</u>, *Pediatrics*, 1994 Jun;93(6 Pt 1):913-7.